



CPF
Collaborative Partnership
on Forests

CPF GLOBAL FOREST EXPERT PANELS

2ND MEETING OF THE EXPERT PANEL ON BIODIVERSITY, FOREST MANAGEMENT, AND REDD+

(BELÉM, BRAZIL, 27-29 AUGUST 2012)

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

10 September 2012

The Second Meeting of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management and REDD+ was held on 27-29 August 2012 at Embrapa Amazonia Oriental in Belém, Brazil. Fifteen Panel Members and representatives of IUFRO and Embrapa participated in the meeting, which was chaired by John Parrotta, Chair of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management, and REDD+. A list of participants is annexed to the minutes.

1 Opening of the meeting

Doc: Draft agenda

Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, opened the meeting welcoming the participants on behalf of the International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO) and expressing thanks to Embrapa Amazonia Oriental for kindly hosting the meeting.

Austrelino Silveira Filho, Head, Embrapa Amazonia Oriental, addressed the participants on behalf of Director Claudio Carvalho. He presented the institution and the activities carried out by Embrapa Amazonia Oriental, and stressed the relevance of the scientific assessment for international discussions on REDD+. He wished the participants a successful meeting and a pleasant excursion and stay in Belém.

In his introductory remarks C. Wildburger underlined that the mission of GFEP is to support forest-related intergovernmental processes by assessing available scientific information in a comprehensive, interdisciplinary, objective, open and transparent way and by producing reports on forest-related issues of high concern. In this context he emphasised that the main tasks of the meeting were to address the review comments and refine the chapters accordingly, as well as to develop the conclusions for chapter 6. He reminded the participants of the work schedule and announced that the emerging findings will be presented at REDD+ Day on 16 October during CBD COP11 in Hyderabad, India.

2 Overview on state of the assessment and further steps

John Parrotta welcomed the participants in his role as Chair of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management and REDD+, and thanked Embrapa Amazonia Oriental for their hospitality and for the organisation of the meeting.

He conveyed the regrets of Ian Thompson, CLA chapter 2, and other Panel members (Kimiko Okabe, Jason Tylanakis, Manuel Guariguata, Nophea Sasaki, Lian Pin Koh, Sango Mahanty, Harro van Asselt, Charlotte Streck) for being unable to participate in the meeting. He welcomed Adrian Martin, University of East Anglia, new Panel member and a lead author for chapter 4. All participants introduced themselves in a *tour de table*.

J. Parrotta gave a short overview about the state of the assessment. He pointed out that the generally constructive comments received from peer reviewers would give good guidance to the Panel members, and should be the basis for work in the coming days. Keeping in mind the target audience of the report, the participants should consider the general issues first, and then address the specific review comments. Furthermore, he explained that the structure of chapter 6 on general conclusions should be based on condensed and focused sets of conclusions of the individual chapters, which should be developed by the author teams in the course of the meeting.

No objections were raised concerning the proposed meeting agenda.

3 Introduction to the summary of review comments

Doc: Summary of review comments

Stephanie Mansourian, editor of the assessment report, presented the summary of review comments and explained that 16 experts peer-reviewed the drafts and submitted their comments, five of them on the overall report, the others on individual chapters. She highlighted key overarching points emerging from the reviews (clarifying purpose upfront, clarifying audience, improving flow structure and headings, improving linkages across chapters and between sections, ensuring consistency of terminology, clarifying differences in chapters, tightening language and avoiding generalisations/unsubstantiated opinions, including additional literature and filling gaps) as a basis for the subsequent discussion. She stressed that the reviewers did not see the introduction chapter, while several of the comments would be addressed in that chapter. She also emphasized the length of chapters as an issue to be dealt with.

4 General discussion on addressing the review comments

All CLAs were invited to present a short summary of reactions to the review comments received. Overall, the CLAs agreed that, the comments were predominantly constructive and clearly addressed weak points in the structure, flow and linkages of the chapters, which were generally due to the tight schedule of the assessment. The participants agreed to cooperate also across chapters to tighten and restructure chapters where necessary, to review the use

of key definitions, and to streamline the messages and better identify knowledge gaps in the conclusions.

In addition, it was agreed that the following aspects were to be considered in revising the chapters:

- Authors may need to decide about the number of references to include, however it should not impede the readability of the text. To the extent possible, there should not be more than 3 references for one key point/argument.
- The text of chapters should not exceed 30 pages (assuming 500 words/page) including tables and figures, but excluding references. Considerable reductions need to be made in chapters 2 and 3; some material may be included in annexes.
- Chapters should include an abstract of 250-300 words keywords.
- There will be a reference list at the end of each chapter.

Furthermore, it was agreed that a column explaining how authors dealt with the review comments would be introduced to the respective spread sheets containing review comments per chapter. CLAs would need to fill it in and IUFRO Headquarters would keep it and make it available on request.

5 Breakout groups

The participants split in breakout groups according to chapters to address review comments and refine chapters. The groups decided that chapters 2 and 3 as well as chapters 4 and 5 would jointly discuss structural issues as well as overlaps and gaps.

6 Reporting back from breakout groups

Each chapter group reported on progress in refining the drafts. Consequently, the participants discussed the coherence between chapters and the storyline of the report.

7 Discussion on pending issues in addressing review comments

The Chair and the participants decided that it would be most useful to continue the work on refining the chapter drafts in the breakout groups.

8 General discussion on assessment conclusions

Following the suggestions by the Chair, the participants agreed that the assessment conclusions in chapter 6 would be structured along sets of condensed chapter conclusion to be developed by the chapters' author teams. These condensed chapter conclusions should not exceed 600 words. Consequently, the Chair will elaborate a draft of chapter 6 on assessment conclusions, which will be further developed in collaboration with the CLAs, the GFEP Coordinator and the editor of the assessment.

9 Breakout groups

The participants again split in chapter breakout groups to revisit the chapter conclusions in order to develop their contributions to chapter 6 and to further refine the chapter drafts.

10 Outline of assessment conclusions

The CLAs presented their contributions to the assessment's conclusion in chapter 6 and the Panel further discussed the structure of the chapter. As proposed by the Chair, it was agreed that the chapter would be structured along the research questions of the assessment, complemented by introductory paragraphs and concluding paragraphs. The Chair will develop a first draft of chapter 6 in collaboration with the GFEP Coordinator and the editor and submit it to the CLAs for comments.

11 Organisation of work and next steps

The following organisational issues were discussed:

Schedule for finalizing the report:

- 15 September 2012: Deadline for final draft of chapters.
- 15 – 30 September: Editing of final chapter drafts, development of final drafts of introduction and conclusions.
- 30 September 2012: Edited drafts will be sent by the editor to CLAs for final comments; deadline for CLAs to submit final reference lists, and abstracts of chapters. Any final references, figures and photo (with complete captions) would have to be submitted by this date. Anything received beyond that date (or incomplete figures/photos) will not be included.
- 7 October 2012: Deadline for final submissions of any remaining comments on edited chapters, as well as review tables with column specifying how comments were addressed.
- 10 October 2012: Assessment report ready for graphic layout.

Policy brief:

After finalizing the full report a policy brief will be developed by the editorial team based on the conclusions of the assessment. It will highlight key messages of the assessment and be approximately 8-16 pages including photos, graphs, boxes and tables.

Figures, tables and photographs:

Figures, tables and photos will be part of the assessment report and of the policy brief. If copying figures or tables from literature, the authors were asked to either provide the respective authorisation or inform the IUFRO Headquarters as soon as possible, in order to obtain the authorisation for reproduction in time. The Panel Members were also invited to provide high quality photos on the assessment's topics including captions and credits.

Emerging findings of the assessment will be presented on 16 October at REDD+ Day during the CBD COP 11 meeting in Hyderabad, India. The full report as well as the policy brief will be launched at the UNFCCC COP 18 in Doha, Qatar.

12 Final summary by the Panel Chair

In summarising the meeting's outcomes the Chair emphasized that major steps towards finalising the assessment report were taken: The draft conclusions for all chapters were refined and chapter contributions to the overall conclusions were developed; overlaps between chapters and restructuring of chapters were successfully addressed; and the follow-up work was assigned.

13 Closure of the Panel Meeting

In closing the meeting, J.Parrotta, Panel Chair, and C. Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, reiterated thanks to Embrapa for hosting the meeting and to the participants for their excellent contributions and their commitment. They especially expressed their gratitude to Ms Joice Ferreira and Mr Toby Gardner for their support in organising the meeting.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Mr John Parrotta [Panel Chair]

International Science Policy Analyst
U.S. Forest Service, Research & Development
1601 N. Kent Street
Arlington, VA 22209, USA
Tel: +1-703-605-4178
Fax: +1-703-605-5131
E-mail: jparrotta@fs.fed.us

Mr Christoph Wildburger [GFEP Coordinator]

Consultant, Environmental Policy and
Natural Resource Management
Lilienbrunnngasse 18/2/52
1020 Vienna, Austria
Tel: +43 (1) 216 48 44 24
Fax: +43 (1) 216 48 44 44
Email: office@wildburger.cc

Mr Samuel Assembe Mvondo

CIFOR Central Africa Regional Office
Forests and Governance Programme
P.O. Box 2008
Yaoundé, Cameroon
Tel : +237 222749
Email : S.Assembe@cgiar.org

Ms Joice Ferreira

Embrapa Amazonia Oriental
Trav. Dr. Enéas Pinheiro s/n°
Caixa Postal, 48 Belém, PA-
Brazil CEP 66095-100
Email: joice.1.ferreira@gmail.com
TEI: +55(91)3204.1206

Mr Toby Gardner

NERC Fellow and Darwin College Fellow
Conservation Science Group
Department of Zoology
University of Cambridge
Downing Street
CB2 3EJ, Cambridge
Tel: +44(0)1223 336675
Fax: +44(0)1223 336676
E-mail: tobyagardner@gmail.com

Mr Markku Kanninen

Professor of Tropical Silviculture
Director, Viikki Tropical Resources Institute (VITRI)
University of Helsinki
Helsinki, Finland
Tel: +358 9 19158133
Fax: +358 9 19158100
E-mail: markku.kanninen@helsinki.fi

Ms Valerie Kapos

Senior Programme Officer in Forest Biodiversity,
Conservation & Climate Change
UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre
219 Huntingdon Road
Cambridge CB3 0DL, United Kingdom
Tel: +44(0)1223 277314 ext 247, direct line 01223 814647
Fax: +44(0)1223 277136
E-mail: val.kapos@unep-wcmc.org

Mr Werner Kurz

Natural Resources Canada
Canadian Forest Service
506 West Burnside Road
Victoria, British Columbia V8Z 1 M5, Canada
Tel: +1-250-298-2310
Fax: +1-250-3630775
E-mail: wkurz@nrcan.gc.ca

Ms Agnieszka Latawiec

International Institute for Sustainability (IIS)
Rio de Janeiro, Brasil
Email: A.latawiec@iis-rio.org

Ms Stephanie Mansourian [Editor]

Consultant, Environment and Development
36 Mont d'Eau du Milieu
1276 Gingins, Switzerland
Tel: + 41 223663276/ 079 6338839
Email: smansourian@bluewin.ch / smansourian@infomaniak.ch

Mr Adrian Martin

University of East Anglia
Norwich Research Park
Norwich NR47TJ
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 (0) 1603593723
Email: adrian.martin@uea.ac.uk

Ms Constance L. McDermott

James Martin Senior Fellow
Rm. 30 152.30.47a
Environmental Change Institute
School of Geography and the Environment
University of Oxford
South Parks Road Oxford OX1 3QY, United Kingdom
Tel: +44 (0)1865 275870
Fax: +44 (0)1865 275850
Email: constance.mcdermott@ouce.ox.ac.uk

Ms Yude Pan

Research Forester
USDA Forest Service
Global Change Program
11 Campus Blvd, Suite 200
Newtown Square, PA 19073
Tel: 610-557-4205
Fax: 610 557-4095
E-mail: ypan@fs.fed.us, yudepan@princeton.edu

Ms Christine Schmitt

Albert-Ludwig University Freiburg
Institute for Landscape Management
Tennenbacher Str. 4
D-79106 Freiburg
Germany
Tel: +49-(0)761-203-3630
Fax: +49-(0)761-203-3638
Email: christine.schmitt@landespflge.uni-freiburg.de

Mr. Bernardo B.N. Strassburg

International Institute for Sustainability (IIS)
Rio de Janeiro, Brazil
Tel: +552121471018
Email: bernardobns@gmail.com ; b.strassburg@iis-rio.org

Mr Bhaskar Vira

Department of Geography
University of Cambridge
Downing Place, Cambridge CB2 3EN, UK
Tel: +44(0)1223 339823
Fax: +44(0)1223 333392
E-mail: bv101@cam.ac.uk
Supporting staff:

Ms Renate Prüller

International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)
Hauptstrasse 7, 1140 Vienna, Austria
Tel: +43-1-8770151-17
Email: prueller@iufro.org