



**CPF**  
Collaborative Partnership  
on Forests

## CPF GLOBAL FOREST EXPERT PANELS

### 1<sup>ST</sup> MEETING OF THE EXPERT PANEL ON BIODIVERSITY, FOREST MANAGEMENT AND REDD+ (ROME, ITALY, 2-3 FEBRUARY 2012)

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING

*15 February 2012*

The First Meeting of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management and REDD+ was held on 2- 3 February 2012 at the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in Rome, Italy. Twenty-five Panel Members and representatives of IUFRO and FAO participated in the meeting, which was chaired by John Parrotta, Chair of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management, and REDD+. A list of participants is annexed to the minutes.

### 1 Opening of the meeting

#### Document: Draft agenda

Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, opened the meeting, welcoming the participants on behalf of the International Union of Forest Research Organisations (IUFRO) and thanking FAO for kindly hosting the meeting.

Mette Løyche Wilkie (Principal Officer, Forest Assessment, Management and Conservation Division) addressed the participants on behalf of Eduard Rojas-Briales, Assistant Director-General FAO and Chair of the Collaborative Partnership on Forests (CPF). She stressed the relevance of the envisaged scientific assessment for international discussions on REDD+ and underlined the commitment of FAO to further contribute to the work of the Panel. In this context she highlighted the potential role of FAO in providing relevant data.

In his introductory remarks C. Wildburger informed the participants about the background and rationale of the Global Forest Expert Panels Initiative (GFEP). GFEP was established by the Collaborative Partnership on Forests in 2007 and is led and coordinated by IUFRO. The mission of GFEP is to support forest-related intergovernmental processes by assessing available scientific information in a comprehensive, interdisciplinary, objective, open and transparent way and by producing reports on forest-related issues of high concern.



GFEP establishes thematic Expert Panels on important issues emerging in international policy processes and involves leading scientists in the field. The work of the Panels is conducted according to Terms of Reference (ToR), which are subject to approval by a Steering Committee<sup>1</sup>. The products of the Expert Panels are focused reports reflecting the state-of-the-art understanding on the subject matter.

He stressed that all scientists participate in their personal capacity in GFEP and do not represent any organisation or institution. In the framework of GFEP no new research is carried out, but existing scientific literature and information is assessed and synthesized. The assessment reports are subject to a double-blind peer review prior to their publication. He informed participants that previous assessments prepared in the frame of GFEP<sup>2</sup> had succeeded in contributing to international forest-related policy processes and had received significant media coverage.

C. Wildburger then reported that the GFEP Steering Committee established the new Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management, and REDD+ on basis of its ToR in December 2011. This decision was subsequently endorsed by the CPF. He also noted that the GFEP Steering Committee endorsed Dr. John Parrotta, Senior Scientist and International Science Policy Analyst with the U.S. Forest Service, as Chair of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management, and REDD+.

J. Parrotta introduced himself and welcomed the participants in his role as Chair of the Panel. He asked for adoption of the meeting agenda. No objections were raised.

## 2 Brief introduction of participants

All participants briefly introduced themselves in a *tour de table*.

## 3 Introduction to the Terms of Reference of the Expert Panel

Document: *Terms of Reference*

Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, presented an overview of the ToR of the Expert Panel on Biodiversity, Forest Management and REDD+. He emphasized that the task of the Panel is to carry out a comprehensive assessment of available information about the linkages between biodiversity, carbon and forest management in the context of REDD+ and to prepare a report for consideration at UNFCCC COP18, CBD COP11 and UNFF10.

He explained that the main objectives of the assessment are: to clarify the interactions among

---

<sup>1</sup> Consisting of six CPF Members (in alphabetical order): CIFOR, the CBD Secretariat, FAO, ICRAF, IUFRO (chair), and the UNFF Secretariat

<sup>2</sup> “Adaptation of Forests and People to Climate Change” (published in April 2009), and “Embracing Complexity: Meeting the Challenges of International Forest Governance” (published in February 2011)



forest management<sup>3</sup>, biodiversity and carbon<sup>4</sup> for different types of forests<sup>5</sup>; to analyze, in relation to these interactions, the social, economic, and environmental synergies and trade-offs under REDD+ implementation; and to identify governance and policy options for REDD+ activities that capture synergies between biodiversity and carbon, and avoid perverse outcomes.

He underlined that the Expert Panel conducts its work independently and should not be policy prescriptive, but rather provide an information basis for policy options. The results of the assessments will be published as a comprehensive peer reviewed assessment report and as a “policy brief”, a summary for policy makers. Both aim at informing policy processes and decision-making.

#### **4 Introduction to the assessment**

##### *Document: Overview of the assessment process*

John Parrotta, Chair of the Expert Panel, presented an overview of the planned assessment. He pointed out that the geographical scope of the assessment is the area in which the REDD+ mechanism is applicable, i.e. the countries eligible for REDD+ financing. The assessment should also take into account limitations to REDD+ activities that may be imposed by environmental and social safeguards.

He explained the assessment’s outline in the ToR and stressed that the format of the envisaged assessment report will follow those of previous GFEP assessments. The length for the four main chapters will be limited to approximately 25 pages or 12,500 words (including figures and boxes, but excluding references).

He emphasized the need for consistent use of terminology, which should be based on existing terms and widely accepted definitions. He also addressed issues of information availability, consistency, certainty, and scale (temporal and spatial) that should be taken into account, and asked Panel Members to consider using a four-class framework (win-win, win-lose, lose-win, lose-lose) for summarizing key interactions between biodiversity, carbon, forest management, and related impacts.

The Panel Chair also explained tasks, responsibilities, and working modalities of authors. He highlighted that Lead Authors (LAs) produce designated chapter sections, Coordinating Lead Authors (CLAs) are responsible for integrating the work of the LAs into cohesive chapters, and Contributing Authors (CAs) assist with preparing chapter sections. All authors should base their syntheses on the best available scientific information and most relevant sources.

---

<sup>3</sup> Activities aimed at conservation, sustainable management of forests, and enhancement of forest carbon stocks (including afforestation and agroforestry) to meet REDD+ intentions

<sup>4</sup> Net balance of CO<sub>2</sub> and non-CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse gas emissions and removals

<sup>5</sup> According to the FAO definition

## 5 Introduction of draft chapter outlines

The following CLAs presented preliminary chapter outlines based on the annotated outline of the assessment in the ToR:

- Chapter 1 – Introduction: John Parrotta
- Chapter 2 – Impacts of deforestation and degradation on biodiversity and carbon for various ecological zones and major forest types: Ian Thompson
- Chapter 3 – Impacts of forest management on biodiversity and carbon for various ecological zones and major forest types: Valerie Kapos and Werner Kurz
- Chapter 4 – Economic and social synergies and trade-offs to achieve objectives relating to biodiversity and REDD+: Bernardo Strassburg
- Chapter 5 – Governance and policy options to achieve objectives relating to biodiversity and REDD+: Constance McDermott

In general it was agreed that the chapter headings might need refinement in the course of the drafting process. Chapter 6 on conclusions will be drafted by the Chair and the CLAs on basis of the chapter outcomes.

## 6 General discussion on chapter outlines

Based on the initial presentations the participants discussed issues regarding the outline of the assessment and its chapters.

### *General issues*

The importance of a common typology and terminology was reiterated. Regarding the glossary in the assessment it was agreed that it is work in progress.

The main audiences of the assessment were discussed. The report should equally aim at climate policy, biodiversity policy, and forest policy related audiences. In general, the GFEP reports are targeted mainly at the experts advising decision-makers.

### *Chapter 1*

In general, concern was raised that the “people agenda” might not be addressed adequately in the report. J. Parrotta suggested that the introduction should frame all related questions. Furthermore, matters of spatial and temporal scale will also be discussed and, as far as possible, defined in chapter 1.

### *Chapter 2*

The overlaps between chapters 2 and 3 were discussed and it was agreed to focus the theoretical science relating to biodiversity and carbon in chapter 2. In addition, potential crossovers with chapter 4 on ecosystem services were addressed.

### *Chapter 3*

The linkages to the 5 REDD+ activities defined in the UNFCCC as well as the question of reference levels for forest management were discussed in general. Specifically, it was seen as important to develop a “taxonomy of interventions” and to take into account the scales of interventions and impacts. Issues of typology, terminology and monitoring were also addressed.

### *Chapters 4 and 5*

Participants discussed the links and overlaps between chapters 4 and 5. It was suggested that drivers of deforestation should be addressed in these chapters. Furthermore, the interlinkage between chapters 3 and 4 on social issues was debated (3 should focus on site-related aspects, 4 on landscape-related issues).

## **7 Allocation of authors**

The Chair invited the Panel Member to announce their preferred allocation to the chapters of the assessment. He encouraged them to contribute to more than one chapter, as appropriate. The Panel Members explained their preference and potential contributions to respective chapters in a *tour de table*. Bhaskar Vira kindly accepted the invitation to serve as Co-CLA for chapter 4.

## **8 Break-out groups**

The participants split into break-out groups to further elaborate the structure of the assessment, to refine the chapter outlines and allocate the specific tasks to authors.

Initially, two break-out groups on chapters 2/3 and on chapters 4/5 discussed the content of the chapters and the division of work between chapters. Consequently, the structure of each chapter was further developed in four separate break-out groups and sub-chapter sections were assigned to authors. The CLAs reported the outcomes to the plenary. It was agreed to upload all presented chapter outlines to the Panel’s website ([www.iufro.org/science/gfep/biodiv-forman-redd-panel/restricted](http://www.iufro.org/science/gfep/biodiv-forman-redd-panel/restricted)) and update them according to further refinements.

## **9 Organisation of work**

The participants discussed the schedule for the assessment as well as future meeting dates. The first draft manuscripts of all chapters should be submitted to the Panel Chair and the GFEP Coordinator and shared with all CLAs by 7 May 2012. The CLAs agreed to hold a meeting in

mid-May 2012 in Vienna, which will focus on ensuring consistency and coherence between the chapters. Following this meeting of the CLAs, a second revised draft of each chapter should be finalized by mid-June. The peer review of chapters (and the full draft report) will take place between late June and early August.

Following the peer review, the next Expert Panel Meeting should take place end of August during which the Panel will jointly discuss and address the review comments before finalizing the manuscripts. C. Wildburger suggested convening the 2<sup>nd</sup> Panel Meeting on 27-29 August 2012. No objections were raised. Joice Ferreira kindly offered to explore possibilities of hosting the meeting at EMPRAPA in Belém, Brazil.

The 18<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC in December 2012 constitutes the binding deadline for the release of the printed assessment report and policy brief. The results of the assessment, however, should be available already before the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity (to be held in Hyderabad, India, 8-19 October 2012). Given these considerations, the deadline for the final manuscript will be 30 September 2012. The policy brief will be subsequently drafted by the editorial team on the basis of the final draft manuscripts.

## 10 Closure of the meeting

On behalf of E. Rojas-Briales, Mette Løyche Wilkie thanked the participants for coming to FAO and Rome. She again ensured the participants of FAO's support to the process and the work of the GFEP assessment.

In closing the meeting, J.Parrotta, Panel Chair, and C. Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, reiterated thanks to FAO for hosting the meeting and to the participants for their excellent contributions.



## ANNEX: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

### Mr John Parrotta [Panel Chair]

International Science Policy Analyst  
U.S. Forest Service, Research & Development  
1601 N. Kent Street  
Arlington, VA 22209, USA  
Tel: +1-703-605-4178; mobile: +1-787-674-2661  
Fax: +1-703-605-5131  
E-mail: [jparrotta@fs.fed.us](mailto:jparrotta@fs.fed.us)

### Mr Christoph Wildburger [GFEP Coordinator]

Consultant, Environmental Policy and  
Natural Resource Management  
Lilienbrunnngasse 18/2/52  
1020 Vienna, Austria  
Tel: +43 (1) 216 48 44 24  
Fax: +43 (1) 216 48 44 44  
Email: [office@wildburger.cc](mailto:office@wildburger.cc)

### Mr Samuel Assembe Mvondo

Research Fellow  
CIFOR Central Africa Regional Office  
P.O.Box 2008, Yaoundé, Cameroon  
Email: [S.Assembe@cgiar.org](mailto:S.Assembe@cgiar.org)

### Ms Joice Ferreira

Researcher  
Embrapa Amazonia Oriental  
C. Postal 48  
66017-970 - Belem PA, Brazil  
Visiting Researcher  
Conservation Science Group  
University of Cambridge  
CB2 3EJ, Cambridge, United Kingdom  
Tel: +55 91-3204-1206 (Brazil), +44 1223 336675 (UK)  
E-mail: [joyce@cpatu.embrapa.br](mailto:joyce@cpatu.embrapa.br); [joyce.1.ferreira@gmail.com](mailto:joyce.1.ferreira@gmail.com)

### Mr Toby Gardner

NERC Fellow and Darwin College Fellow  
Conservation Science Group  
Department of Zoology  
University of Cambridge  
CB2 3EJ, Cambridge, United Kingdom  
Tel: +44(0)1223 336675  
Fax: +44(0)1223 336676  
E-mail: [tobyagardner@gmail.com](mailto:tobyagardner@gmail.com)



**Mr Manuel Guariguata**

Principal Scientist  
Forest and Environment Programme  
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)  
P.O. Box 0113 BOCBD  
Bogor 16000, Indonesia  
Tel: +62-251-8622622  
Fax: +62-251-8622100  
E-mail: [m.guariguata@cgiar.org](mailto:m.guariguata@cgiar.org)

**Mr Markku Kanninen**

Professor of Tropical Silviculture  
Director, Viikki Tropical Resources Institute (VITRI)  
University of Helsinki  
Helsinki, Finland  
Tel: +358 9 19158133  
Fax: +358 9 19158100  
E-mail: [markku.kanninen@helsinki.fi](mailto:markku.kanninen@helsinki.fi)

**Ms Valerie Kapos**

Senior Programme Officer in Forest Biodiversity,  
Conservation & Climate Change  
UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre  
219 Huntingdon Road  
Cambridge CB3 0DL, United Kingdom  
Tel: +44(0)1223 277314 ext 247, direct line 01223 814647  
Fax: +44(0)1223 77136  
E-mail: [val.kapos@unep-wcmc.org](mailto:val.kapos@unep-wcmc.org)

**Mr Werner Kurz**

Senior Research Scientist  
Natural Resources Canada  
Canadian Forest Service  
506 West Burnside Road  
Victoria, British Columbia V8Z 1 M5, Canada  
Tel: +1-250-2982310  
Fax: +1-250-3630775  
E-mail: [wkurz@nrcan.gc.ca](mailto:wkurz@nrcan.gc.ca)

**Ms Constance L. McDermott**

James Martin Senior Fellow  
Rm. 30 152.30.47a  
Environmental Change Institute  
School of Geography and the Environment  
University of Oxford  
South Parks Road Oxford OX1 3QY, United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 (0)1865 275870  
Fax: +44 (0)1865 275850  
Email: [constance.mcdermott@ouce.ox.ac.uk](mailto:constance.mcdermott@ouce.ox.ac.uk)





**Ms Kimiko Okabe**

Senior Research Scientist  
Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI)  
1 Matsunosato, Tsukuba  
Ibaraki 305-8687, Japan  
Tel: +81-29-873-3211 ex. 8250  
Fax: +81-29-873-1543  
E-mail: kimikook@ffpri.affrc.go.jp

**Ms Yude Pan**

Senior Research Scientist  
Climate, Fire, and Carbon Cycle Sciences  
Northern Research Station  
11 Campus Blvd., Suite 200  
Newtown Square, PA 19073, USA  
Tel: +1-610-557-4205  
E-mail: ypan@fs.fed.us

**Mr Lian Pin Koh**

Assistant Professor of Applied Ecology & Conservation, ETH Zurich  
Adjunct Assistant Professor, National University of Singapore  
Department of Environmental Systems Science  
ETH Zurich  
Universitätsstrasse 16, CHN G73.2  
8092 Zurich, Switzerland  
Tel: +41 44 632 6836  
Fax: +41 44 632 1575  
E-mail: lian.koh@env.ethz.ch

**Mr Nophea Sasaki**

Associate Professor  
Graduate School of Applied Informatics  
University of Hyogo  
6F, 7-1-28 Minatojima-minamimachi  
Chuo-ku, Kobe 650-0047, Japan  
Phone/Fax: +81(78)303-1929  
Email: nop.kankyo@ai.u-hyogo.ac.jp; nopsasaki@gmail.com

**Ms Christine Schmitt**

Assistant-Professor  
Albert-Ludwig University Freiburg  
Institute for Landscape Management  
Tennenbacher Str. 4  
D-79106 Freiburg, Germany  
Tel: +49-(0)761-203-3630  
Fax: +49-(0)761-203-3638  
Email: christine.schmitt@landespflge.uni-freiburg.de



**Mr Bernardo B.N. Strassburg**

International Institute for Sustainability

Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Tel: +552121471018; +552193141977

Email: bernardobns@gmail.com ; b.strassburg@iis-rio.org

**Ms Charlotte Streck**

Director, Climate Focus

1025 Connecticut Ave, NW

Suite 1102

Washington, D.C. 20036, USA

Tel: +1-202 540 1984 (office), +1-202 684 1455 (mobile US), +31 646426481 (mobile EU)

E-mail: c.streck@climatefocus.com

**Mr Ian Thompson**

Research Scientist, Ecology and Biodiversity

Natural Resources Canada

Canadian Forest Service

Great Lakes Forestry Centre

1219 Queen Street East

Sault Ste. Marie, Ontario

P6A 2E5 Canada

Tel: +1-705-541-5644

E-mail: Ian.Thompson@NRCan.gc.ca

**Mr Harro Van Asselt**

Marie Curie Fellow, Environmental Change Institute

University of Oxford

South Parks Road

Oxford, OX1 3QY, United Kingdom

Tel: +44(0)1865 275880

E-mail: harro.vanasselt@ouce.ox.ac.uk

**Mr Bhaskar Vira**

Department of Geography

University of Cambridge

Downing Place

Cambridge CB2 3EN, United Kingdom

Tel: +44(0)1223 339823

Fax: +44(0)1223 333392

E-mail: bv101@cam.ac.uk



## **Representatives of the host organization FAO**

### **Ms Susan Braatz**

Senior Forestry Officer  
FAO Forestry Department  
Viale delle Terme di Caracalla  
Rome 00153, Italy  
Tel: +3906-5705-4318  
Fax: +3906-5705-5137  
E-mail: [susan.braatz@fao.org](mailto:susan.braatz@fao.org)

### **Ms Mette Løyche Wilkie**

Principal Officer, Forest Assessment, Management and Conservation Division  
FAO Forestry Department  
Viale delle Terme di Caracalla  
Rome 00153, Italy  
Tel: +3906-5705-2091  
Fax: +3906-5705-5137  
E-mail: [Mette.LoycheWilkie@fao.org](mailto:Mette.LoycheWilkie@fao.org)

## **Supporting staff:**

### **Ms Stephanie Mansourian [Editor]**

Consultant, Environment and Development  
36 Mont d'Eau du Milieu  
1276 Gingins, Switzerland  
Tel: + 41 223663276/ 079 6338839  
Email: [smansourian@bluewin.ch](mailto:smansourian@bluewin.ch); [smansourian@infomaniak.ch](mailto:smansourian@infomaniak.ch)

### **Ms Renate Prüller**

International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)  
Hauptstrasse 7  
1140 Vienna, Austria  
Tel: +43-1-8770151-17  
Email: [prueller@iufro.org](mailto:prueller@iufro.org)

### **Ms Eva-Maria Schimpf**

International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)  
Hauptstrasse 7  
1140 Vienna, Austria  
Tel: +43-1-8770151-21  
Fax: +43-1-8770150-55  
Email: [schimpf@iufro.org](mailto:schimpf@iufro.org)

