



## International Union of Forest Research Organizations

Union Internationale des  
Instituts de Recherches  
Forestières

Unión Internacional  
de Organizaciones de  
Investigación Forestal

Internationaler  
Verband Forstlicher  
Forschungsanstalten



**CPF**  
Collaborative Partnership  
on Forests

### CPF GLOBAL FOREST EXPERT PANELS

**3<sup>RD</sup> MEETING OF THE EXPERT PANEL ON  
FORESTS AND FOOD SECURITY  
NEW DELHI, INDIA  
23-25 NOVEMBER 2014**

## Minutes of the meeting

**28 November 2014**

The Global Forest Expert Panel (GFEP) on Forests and Food Security convened for its third meeting on 23-25 November at the World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF) South Asia regional office in New Delhi. Sixteen Panel Members participated in the meeting, which was moderated by Bhaskar Vira, Chair of the Expert Panel on Forests and Food Security. A list of participants is annexed to these minutes.

### **1. Welcome by the regional director of ICRAF – Javed Rizvi**

Javed Rizvi, director of ICRAF's South Asia office, officially opened the meeting and welcomed participants to ICRAF's regional office.

### **2. Opening of the meeting by the GFEP Coordinator - Christoph Wildburger**

Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, welcomed participants to the third meeting of the fourth GFEP Panel on Forests and Food Security. He thanked participants for travelling to Delhi and noted that Stepha McMullen, Nitin Rai and Amy Ickowitz were stepping in to represent the three Coordinating Lead Authors (CLAs) of Chapters 2, 3 and 4 respectively.

### **3. Welcome by the chair – Bhaskar Vira**

Bhaskar Vira, Panel Chair, in turn welcomed participants to the third meeting of the GFEP Panel. He summarised the key objective of the meeting and the agenda, noting that the main purpose was to address comments received from the double-blind review. Given that this was the final full panel meeting, he also emphasised the importance of spending time working in chapter groups, and of taking the opportunity to discuss across groups where necessary.

### **4. Presentation of review results**

Stephanie Mansourian, GFEP editor, presented a summary of the review process and the key messages emerging from the review. She noted that a total of nine external reviewers provided detailed feedback on the chapters, that these reviewers came from different institutions (international organisations as well as academia) and that they represented both social and biological sciences. She also informed the group that eight internal reviews had also been received from Panel Members.

Key messages that emerged from the review were the need to:

- align conceptual frameworks across chapters
- define upfront the range of land uses covered
- ensure to avoid advocacy styles
- diversify regional examples (and include mangroves)
- reduce the current bias towards local forest-dependent communities
- enhance the importance of major drivers of deforestation (notably agribusiness) in the report
- emphasise the growing number of forest-reliant farmers and declining access to land
- emphasise the “voice of the hungry” rather than just institutional voices
- improve all the conclusions sections
- improve introductions, assuming that people might just read individual chapters
- ensure consistency in terminology
- align styles

## 5. General discussion

Bhaskar Vira opened the floor for comments and any general responses on progress to date, and on the general review comments received.

The point was made that through the process to date, it has become apparent that there is scarcity of evidence on the subject matter. B. Vira noted that it was important to clearly separate in the text what was drawn from evidence and what was inferred.

In terms of overarching issues, it was also noted that different chapters use slightly different terminology (for example, “forest and food systems” or “forest and tree-based systems and food systems”...) and that this needs to be ironed out in the next report iteration. Equally, the need to define the term “landscape” (and include it in the glossary) was raised. Commonly agreed definitions to be included in the report glossary would help to ensure consistency across the report.

The importance of governance and access as a potential organising framework was raised, in particular given the fact that most forest is publically owned while agroforestry takes place predominantly on private land. It was also noted that the issue of resilience is not explicit in the draft report and will need to be given more visibility in the next iteration.

A significant discussion ensued on the perimeter of the “system(s)” being addressed and a number of possible diagrams and figures to explicitly define the conceptual framework and scope of the review were proposed, discussed and refined by the Panel Members.

It was agreed that the terminology “forests and tree-based systems” would be used to refer to the land uses covered by the report. A discussion also followed on the scope and components of the “food security and nutrition” aspects. Again, a number of visual aids were produced to ensure everyone agreed on the different components and their relative importance. This discussion provided useful clarification on key issues that arose as a result of the review process and enabled Panel Members to be on the same page about the specific components of the scope of the report.

Furthermore, it was agreed that the first chapter would need to incorporate some key concepts and frame the scope of the report, also in terms of terminology and setting the perimeters of the systems covered by the report.

## 6. Break out groups

Chapter break out groups further considered general review comments and ways to restructure their chapters and address key gaps. Different chapter authors moved between chapter groups as sections were being moved from one chapter to another, reflecting the complex integrated nature of the report. The gender team also met separately to see what key gaps they observed and to feed that back to respective CLAs.

## 7. Presentation of chapters

An overview of chapters was introduced by each CLA so that the group could see which significant new sections or re-structuring was taking place at the level of individual chapters. Further time was then provided for chapter break out groups.

Each chapter group also worked on refining its chapter conclusions and provided the preliminary set to the Panel Chair.

## 8. Discussion on outstanding issues

On the final day, the morning was spent in break out groups. B. Vira then asked each Panel Member to share the single key message they would like to see emerge from the report. The following were noted:

- *Underestimated role of forests in food security*
- *Differentiated roles and outcomes of forests in food security*
- *Customary use of forests under tenurial regime is recognised and facilitated by policy (especially in the context of changing policies that are erasing local use)*
- *Lend legitimacy to forests as being important to food and nutrition*
- *More forestry and conservation people taking nutrition-sensitive approach/lens to conservation/land use policy*
- *Bringing agenda of food and nutrition to forestry and conservation community – opportunity to raise understanding of role of forestry as part of food systems*
- *It is critically important to recognise forests as essential for both vulnerable populations and potentially better off*
- *There is a sea change in decision-makers' awareness of the role of forests and tree-based systems to provide micronutrients and take actions to safeguard these products, with special emphasis on eliminating gender and other inequalities*
- *Emphasise need to enrich knowledge on tree species essential for food and nutrition*
- *Increase funding for research for species (nutritional compounds)*
- *Interplay between women and men's roles in context of land tenure – how land tenure impacts on women and men and how can we develop recommendations at policy level to remove gaps*
- *Highlight role of forests and tree-based systems in food and nutrition– for diversifying diets and providing better quality diets as a long term sustainable solution*
- *Ensuring that lack of evidence is being addressed so future research can fill gaps*
- *Highlight opportunities and need for collaboration between forest scientists and agricultural community*
- *Food security high on agenda but forests ignored, report should provide scientific evidence to prove role of forests to bring to decision-makers*
- *Allow more integrated approach to understand agriculture-forest mosaic and break silos*

The next steps and schedule of the report were presented by C. Wildburger.

**Schedule (from this day forward):**

UNFCCC COP 20: Presentation of emerging key findings	<b>1 - 12 December 2014, Lima, Peru</b>
Assessment report manuscripts ready for editing	<b>31 January 2015</b>
Deadline for submission of papers to Environmental Conservation	<b>31 January 2015</b>
Assessment report manuscripts ready for layout	<b>1 March 2015</b>
UNFF11: <i>Launch of report and presentation of results</i>	<b>4 -15 May 2015 New York, USA</b>

In terms of launching and presenting the report to a wide audience, B. Vira emphasised that all Panel Members should feel in a position to present the report should they attend a relevant meeting and that in this respect the media team and core team at IUFRO would provide them with necessary support.

The following regional meetings that could be of interest were suggested by Panel Members:

- 1) The **Third Climate Smart Agriculture** conference, March 16-18 Montpellier (organised by CIRAD);
- 2) The 15th Biannual International Conference of the **International Association for the Study of the Commons** - 25-29 May, Edmonton;
- 3) The 11th international conference of the **European Society for Ecological Economics**, 30 June - 2 July 2015 in Leeds.

Panel Members were reminded of deadlines and editorial guidelines as well as of the need to send figures and photos (together with high level quality files and copyright information) to IUFRO (Renate) as soon as possible.

There was a brief discussion on the importance of the key conclusions to feed into the Policy Brief for decision makers that would also be a side-product of the Panel on Forests and Food Security. The Policy Brief would be drafted by B. Vira, C. Wildburger and S. Mansourian, based on the key messages emerging from the report, but written for a policy audience. This would be done in late January and February with the input of the CLAs.

It was also noted that Panel Members should start to identify key terms for the glossary so that a complete glossary could be available by the end of the year. S. Mansourian would circulate a new draft glossary with terms that she felt still needed defining in the next few days.

## 9. Closure of the meeting

B. Vira thanked the Panel Members for the active participation in the third Panel meeting. C. Wildburger thanked the local organizers for the excellent organization and closed the meeting.

## CLA meeting

A CLA meeting was held in the afternoon of 25 November, also bringing two of the absent CLAs in through a Skype conference call.

B. Vira introduced three key documents that had been sent to CLAs before lunch: 1. a document with draft diagrams and figures that could form the backbone of the report's conceptual framework, 2. the outlines for all the chapters as they had been re-worked during the meeting, and 3. draft key messages emerging from the current draft of chapter conclusions.

He emphasised the importance of finalising key conclusions for chapters so that those could feed into the final Conclusions chapter (Chapter 7).

CLAs were reminded that in addressing reviewers' comments, they should also note in the "review spreadsheet" for their chapter how they addressed the comments (and if not, why not). This spreadsheet would then need to be provided to IUFRO once the chapters are finalised.

A date was set for the next (virtual) CLA meeting: **19 January**, 12PM European time, 11AM UK time, 2PM Nairobi time, 6PM Indonesia time and 6AM US Eastern time.

C. Wildburger asked CLAs to also suggest potential titles for the report.

### Next deadlines:

- By 19 December the glossary would need to be completed with all key, and possibly contentious, terms clarified and agreed.
- By 15 January a near final draft of all chapters would be circulated
- Between 15-19 January Chapter 7 would be drafted by B. Vira, C. Wildburger and S. Mansourian.
- 19 January holding of a CLA virtual meeting (see times above).
- The absolute final deadline for chapters is 31 January.

After that date, it was noted that as the report was being finalised in February, there would be a need for some final direct communications between CLAs and the editorial team (B. Vira, C. Wildburger and S. Mansourian).

## **Annex I: List of Participants**

### **Ms Bina Agarwal**

Professor of Development Economics and Environment  
DPM, School of Environment, Education and Development  
University of Manchester  
Manchester M13 9PL, UK  
and Institute of Economic Growth, Delhi, India  
Tel: +91-9810744677  
E-mail: [bina\\_india@yahoo.com](mailto:bina_india@yahoo.com)

### **Ms Bimbika Sijapati Basnett**

Scientist  
Forests and Governance  
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)  
P.O.Box 0113 BOCBD  
Bogor, Indonesia  
Tel: +62(0)2518622622; +6281212426141  
E-mail: [b.basnett@cgiar.org](mailto:b.basnett@cgiar.org)

### **Ms Beatrice Darko Obiri**

Forestry Research Institute of Ghana  
P.O. Box UP 63 KNUST  
Kumasi, Ghana  
Tel: +233-03220-60123/60373  
E-mail: [bdobiri@csir-forig.org.gh](mailto:bdobiri@csir-forig.org.gh); [bdobiri@yahoo.com](mailto:bdobiri@yahoo.com)

### **Ms Jennie Dey De Pryck**

Senior Gender Adviser and Consultant  
Global Forum on Agricultural Research (GFAR)  
c/o FAO, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla  
00153 Rome, Italy  
Tel: +39 340 145 7804 (Italy), +32 471 86 26 71 (Belgium)  
E-mail: [jenniedeydepryck@yahoo.com](mailto:jenniedeydepryck@yahoo.com)

### **Ms Amy Ickowitz**

Scientist, Forests and Livelihoods  
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)  
Bogor, Indonesia  
Tel: +62(0)2518622622  
Email: [a.ickowitz@cgiar.org](mailto:a.ickowitz@cgiar.org)

### **Ms Stephanie Mansourian-Stephenson**

GFEP Editor, Consultant, Environment and Development  
36 Mont d'Eau du Milieu  
1276 Gingins, Switzerland  
Tel: + 41 223663276/ 079 6338839  
Email: [smansourian@informaniak.ch](mailto:smansourian@informaniak.ch)

**Ms Stepha McMullin**

World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF)  
P.O. Box 30677, 00 100 Nairobi  
Kenya  
Tel: +254 20 722 4203  
E-mail: [S.Mcmullin@cgiar.org](mailto:S.Mcmullin@cgiar.org)

**Mr Henry Neufeldt**

Head Climate Change Unit  
World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF)  
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri  
P.O. Box 30677, 00100 Nairobi  
Kenya  
Tel: + 254 20 722 4238  
Email: [H.Neufeldt@cgiar.org](mailto:H.Neufeldt@cgiar.org)

**Ms Sarah Ayeri Ogalleh**

Senior Scientist  
Centre for Training & Integrated Research in ASAL Development (CETRAD)  
Buttsons Complex, Off Hospital Road P.O.BOX 144  
10400, Nanyuki, Kenya  
Telephone (office): +254-725- 348- 449; (mobile) +254-787-704-599  
Email: [sarahayeri@yahoo.com](mailto:sarahayeri@yahoo.com)

**Mr Hemant Ojha**

School of Social Sciences  
University of New South Wales  
Sydney, Australia  
Tel: +61 424733778  
E-mail: [h.ojha@unsw.edu.au](mailto:h.ojha@unsw.edu.au); [ojhahemant1@gmail.com](mailto:ojhahemant1@gmail.com)

**John Parrotta**

Program Leader, International Science Issues  
U.S. Forest Service, Research & Development  
201 14<sup>th</sup> St. SW  
Washington DC 20024, USA  
Tel: +1-703-605-4178  
E-mail: [jparrotta@fs.fed.us](mailto:jparrotta@fs.fed.us)

**Ms Bronwen Powell**

Research Consultant, Forests and Food Security  
CIFOR  
74/3 Bab Tahzoute  
Marrakech, Medina, Morocco  
E-mail: [b.powell@cgiar.org](mailto:b.powell@cgiar.org); [bronwen.powell@hotmail.ca](mailto:bronwen.powell@hotmail.ca)

**Mr Nitin D. Rai**

Ashoka Trust for Research in Ecology  
and the Environment  
Royal Enclave, Srirampura, Jakkur PO  
Bangalore – 560064, India  
Tel: +91 80 23635555  
E-mail: [nitinrai@atree.org](mailto:nitinrai@atree.org)

International Union of Forest  
Research Organizations  
Headquarters - Secretariat

Marxergasse 2  
A-1030 Vienna, Austria

Email: [office@iufro.org](mailto:office@iufro.org)  
Tel.: +43-1-877 01 51-0  
Fax: +43-1-877 01 51-50

**Mr Patrick Van Damme**

Plant Production Department  
Ghent University  
B-9000 Ghent  
Belgium  
Tel: +32 9 2646087  
Email: [Patrick.VanDamme@ugent.be](mailto:Patrick.VanDamme@ugent.be)

**Mr Bhaskar Vira**

Department of Geography  
University of Cambridge  
Downing Place  
Cambridge CB2 3EN, UK  
Tel: +44(0)1223 339823  
Fax: +44(0)1223 333392  
E-mail: [bv101@cam.ac.uk](mailto:bv101@cam.ac.uk)

**Mr Christoph Wildburger**

GFEP Coordinator, Consultant  
Environmental Policy and  
Natural Resource Management  
Lilienbrunnngasse 18/2/52  
1020 Vienna, Austria  
Tel: +43 (1) 216 48 44 24  
Fax: +43 (1) 216 48 44 44  
Email: [office@wildburger.cc](mailto:office@wildburger.cc)