



CPF
Collaborative Partnership
on Forests

**CPF GLOBAL FOREST EXPERT PANELS
SCOPING MEETING**

**GFEP RAPID RESPONSE ASSESSMENT ON
ILLEGAL TIMBER TRADE
(NAIROBI, KENYA 18-19 MAY 2016)**

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

07 June 2016

The Scoping Meeting of the Global Forest Expert Panels (GFEP) Rapid Response (RR) assessment on Illegal Timber Trade took place from 18 to 19 May, 2016 in Nairobi, Kenya. Following the kind invitation of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the Scoping Meeting was hosted by UNEP at the United Nations Office in Nairobi, Kenya (UNON). Twenty-five participants, including scientists, members of the Collaborative Partnership on Forests (CPF) and invited stakeholders from expert institutions attended the Scoping Meeting of GFEP RR. The meeting was jointly moderated by Mr Alexander Buck (IUFRO Executive Director) and Ms Daniela Kleinschmit (Scientific Chair of the assessment). A list of participants is annexed to the minutes.

1) Opening of the Meeting

Document: Draft Agenda of the Scoping Meeting

Mr Alexander Buck, IUFRO Executive Director, opened the meeting and welcomed the participants. He thanked UNEP for kindly hosting the Scoping Meeting and gave the floor to Mr Ibrahim Thiaw, UNEP Deputy Executive Director.

Mr Ibrahim Thiaw, UNEP Deputy Executive Director, conveyed welcoming words on behalf of UNEP as the host of the meeting. He informed participants about the on-going efforts to combat illegal trade in wildlife and wildlife products. He pointed out various impacts that illegal timber trade has on local communities, national economies and at the international level. He also high-lighted the inter-linkages of illegal timber trade and other types of illegal activities. All in all, illegal timber trade represents around half of the total economic value of illegal wildlife activities. Mr Thiaw also underlined the significance of the Rapid Response assessment in supporting the efforts to combat illicit timber trade and looked forward to a scientifically sound and policy relevant assessment.

Mr Alexander Buck, IUFRO Executive Director, welcomed the participants on behalf of IUFRO as the lead agency of the GFEP initiative in the CPF. He gave a brief overview of IUFRO and the CPF in general. He highlighted the role of IUFRO in the CPF and made reference to the numerous CPF joint initiatives (e.g. GFEP, GFIS and CPF Policy Learning Initiative) which are

being coordinated by IUFRO. He briefly explained the background of GFEP and the rationale of the current GFEP Rapid Response assessment. He drew attention to the roles of the scientists and experts invited to the meeting and looked forward to fruitful discussions and outcomes.

Mr Alexander Buck conveyed regrets from Mr Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, who unfortunately had to cancel his participation in the Scoping Meeting. He then introduced Ms Daniela Kleinschmit (the Chair of Forest and Environmental Policy at University of Freiburg in Germany, and Coordinator of IUFRO Division 9) as the Scientific Chair of GFEP Rapid Response assessment and Mr Andre Purret as the GFEP Project Manager.

Mr Buck explained the Draft Agenda of the Scoping Meeting and the organization of work during the meeting.

2) Brief Introduction of Participants

All participants briefly introduced themselves in a tour de table. Mr Andre Purret communicated regrets from the representatives of Chatham House, US Forest Service, the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) and the Convention of Biological Diversity (CBD) who had to cancel their participation at the last minute.

3) Setting the Scene

Document: Overview of the assessment (GFEP RR)

Mr Andre Purret, GFEP Project Manager, gave a brief introduction of the GFEP process in general. He noted that the Global Forest Expert Panels (GFEP) initiative was launched in April 2007 as a mechanism to effectively link the information requirements of intergovernmental processes related to forests and trees with existing scientific expertise. GFEP produces objective and independent scientific assessments on key issues of high concern and provides its reports to international fora (e.g. UNFF, CBD, UNFCCC, UN-SDGs) to support informed decision-making at the global level. These assessment reports consolidate available scientific information and expertise. They are prepared by internationally recognized scientific experts and undergo rigorous peer review. The initiative is led and coordinated in the CPF by IUFRO.

He then noted that all scientific experts participate in the assessment in their personal capacity and do not represent any organization or institution. No new research will be carried out, instead the scientists assess and synthesize existing scientific literature and information. Furthermore, GFEP assessments do not aim for advocacy research, but for information that would be the basis for future policy options.

Mr Purret made reference to the previous GFEP assessments and noted that 4 assessments have been carried out so far. The resulting reports and policy briefs were influential in informing relevant policy processes and also received significant media coverage. For example, the last GFEP assessment on Forests and Food Security serves as a basis for the work of the High Level Panel of Experts on Food Security and Nutrition (HLPE) of the United Nations Committee on World Food Security.

Mr Purret then gave a presentation on GFEP Rapid Response assessment on Illegal Timber Trade. He started with the rationale for the new rapid response assessment and mentioned that there has been high level of political attention to the problem. Various resolutions and decisions (e.g. by UNGA, UNEA-1, UNCAC) on this topic have been passed, and there is a need for increased international collaboration to combat illegal trade. He also pointed out that the 2030 Agenda and the newly-adopted SDGs link environmental security and sustainable development and that several UN bodies have been mandated to assist in fighting environmental crime. Numerous scientific publications on this topic are available. Yet, the information has not yet been systematically assessed, analysed and synthesized. Therefore, the CPF asked IUFRO to initiate and coordinate a global scientific assessment on illegal timber trade within the framework of the GFEP initiative. Since the momentum should be captured, a Rapid Response assessment on this topic was established. The main objective of the assessment is to produce a high-quality synthesis report on the topic by December 2016, building on the expertise of eight scientists who serve as Lead Authors and engage relevant Contributing Authors for their chapters if and when needed. The detailed tentative timeline of the assessment can be found under agenda point 8 in the minutes.

Mr Andre Purret then highlighted the following objectives of the Scoping Meeting:

- To introduce Lead Authors and stakeholders to the context, goals and specific objectives of the assessment and its outputs (main report and policy brief)
- To further define the scope of the assessment (thematic components, main questions to be answered, methodology etc.
- To develop a comprehensive, annotated outline of the assessment report
- To clarify the roles, expectations, and specific responsibilities of the Lead Authors of the assessment report
- To identify specific areas of expertise that may be needed for completion of the assessment report and will require the involvement of other Contributing Authors
- To refine the procedure for completion of the assessment

4) Discussion of the Scope of the Assessment

Mr Alexander Buck as the moderator asked the participants for their views and inputs regarding the problem statement, thematic components and main questions that should be addressed in the assessment report. In particular, the stakeholders and expert institutions were asked to point out specific policy questions that could be answered by the scientists through the report.

Participants stated that the problem involves different actors – smallholders and criminal networks – which also require different approaches. Questions were raised about the differentiation between illegal logging and illegal timber trade. The discussion involved topics such as the effectiveness of responses, distinguishing between legal and illegal activities, actors involved in the illegal activities, compliance and law enforcement aspects, definitions of illegal activities, investments for tackling the problem, underlying sources and drivers of the problem, cost and impacts of illegal trade, the need to have an overview of the history on this topic, access to the information, focus and target audience of the report etc.

A few stakeholders and invited experts regrettably could not attend the meeting and sent beforehand their ideas and suggestions on the scope of the assessment. Inputs by Chatham House, US Forest Service and the CBD were communicated to the meeting participants at this point.

Ms Daniela Kleinschmit, the Scientific Chair of the assessment, moderated the other half of the day. She started the discussion by proposing some basic thematic elements to be covered in the assessment, namely the problem statement (including background about illegal logging and timber trade, monitoring and impacts), drivers of illegal logging and timber trade, and responses/options to the problem. Participants agreed that the following dimensions of illegal timber trade should be covered through the assessment: ecological and local impacts; social aspects; economics and trade; political economy; policy and governance; monitoring illegal logging and timber trade; environmental law and crime.

It was agreed that the assessment (i) would look at both the illegal logging and illegal timber trade, (ii) would differentiate between the different actors and types of illegality (e.g. “big fish” and “small fish”), (iii) would address the inter-linkages with other sectors and studies the interactions among different levels, (iv) and would make reference to international, regional, as well as country level examples and cases.

5) Drafting of Annotated Outline for the Assessment Report

Based on the previous discussion and detailed inputs by the participants, a broad outline of the assessment started to take shape.

Ms Kleinschmit guided the discussions, which resulted in the following broad structure of the report (Lead Authors of each chapter are underlined):

- 1) INTRODUCTION (Daniela Kleinschmit, Sina Leipold)
- 2) CONCEPTS OF ILLEGAL LOGGING/TIMBER TRADE (Luca Tacconi)
- 3) ILLEGAL TRADE ECONOMICS (Jianbang Gan, Paolo Cerutti)
- 4) IMPACTS (Pablo Pacheco, Benno Pokorny, Tim Boekhout van Solinge)
- 5) DRIVERS (Benno Pokorny, Pablo Pacheco, Luca Tacconi)
- 6) GOVERNANCE FRAMEWORK AND RESPONSE OPTIONS (Benjamin Cashore, Paolo Cerutti, Sina Leipold)
- 7) IMPLEMENTATION (INCLUDING LAW ENFORCEMENT AND MONITORING) (Tim Boekhout van Solinge, Paolo Cerutti, Valentin Emelin)
- 8) CONCLUSIONS (Daniela Kleinschmit and all Lead Authors)
- 9) ANNEX: Glossary (illegal/legal, formal/informal)

Participants of the meeting continued discussions on the detailed aspects and topics to be included under each chapter. The detailed outline of the assessment will be made available for the meeting participants in due course.

6) Discussion of Methodological Issues

It was agreed that the titles of the chapters and the report might need refinement later on. In the later stages of work, it might also be necessary to merge a couple of chapters or parts/sections of the chapters. Lead Authors discussed the possible overlaps of their chapters and agreed to collaborate with each other to avoid greater overlaps. It was also discussed that the conceptual chapter (no.2) should serve as a basis for all other chapters, since these specific concepts would pervade all the report. This demands an earlier draft and finalization of this chapter to allow others to refer to it.

Ms Daniela Kleinschmit explained the methodological issues regarding the use of information and publications. All authors should base their syntheses on the best available scientific information and most relevant sources. It was noted that a lot of information on the topic is not fully scientific and peer-reviewed (e.g. NGO reports), thus it would be wise to divide the references in the end of each chapter (peer-reviewed/not peer-reviewed). It was also agreed that at the end of each chapter future research needs would be listed by theme and topic.

Mr Andre Purret provided information regarding the editing process of the assessment report. Editing will be carried out by the GFEP editor (Ms Stephanie Mansourian), in collaboration with the Scientific Chair, the GFEP Coordinator and the GFEP Project Manager. After finalizing their chapter manuscripts, Lead Authors would need to be available for additional questions by the editor and revision of texts when needed. Mr Purret showed the Editorial Guidelines which the lead authors should follow. The guidelines will also be sent to the Lead Authors following the Scoping Meeting. It was agreed that each chapter can be up to maximum of 15 pages, excluding references, and that the editorial team may ultimately limit and edit the chapters and their length as needed.

7) Identification of Areas of Expertise and Involvement of Contributing Authors

Mr Purret explained the process of selecting Lead Authors and the criteria that need to be followed when Lead Authors select Contributing Authors for their chapters. In case the Lead Author feels that there is a lack of expertise in some field, it will be up to him/her to engage relevant and suitable Contributing Authors. A list of potential Contributing Authors was prepared by the GFEP team during the process of selecting Lead Authors. This list was briefly shown to the meeting participants and will be sent to the Lead Authors following the meeting. It was suggested to the Lead Authors to start looking for and contacting possible Contributing Authors, if needed, as soon as possible. It was also agreed that the Lead Authors would inform the GFEP coordination team of the inclusion of new Contributing Authors.

The GFEP coordination team had collected citations of many useful publications when selecting the Lead Authors for the assessment. These publications were organized alphabetically and the GFEP Project Manager has asked the stakeholders and expert institutions to send him any relevant publications on the topic that should be included. Mr Purret showed the list of publications to meeting participants and promised to forward it to the Lead Authors after the Scoping Meeting, to help them get started with the synthesis of information on the chapter topics.

8) Organization of Work

Participants discussed the communication of the assessment and its outcomes. There was a general understanding that information about the assessment itself should be communicated wherever possible and suitable (e.g. during conferences, meetings etc.). The plan was adopted that the emerging results of the report would possibly be presented during CITES COP 17 in Johannesburg, South Africa in September 2016 and the formal launch of the report and policy brief would take place during CPD COP 13 in Cancun, Mexico in December 2016.

Mr Purret noted that the outcomes of the Scoping Meeting and all related documents for public use would be uploaded to GFEP RR website, hosted as a subpage under IUFRO general website (<http://www.iufro.org/science/gfep/illegal-timber-trade-rapid-response/>). As an immediate next step regarding the outreach of the assessment, IUFRO is preparing a blog article about the Scoping Meeting that will be launched on 5 June 2016 on the occasion of the World Environment Day 2016, where the theme for this year is “*The Illegal Trade in Wildlife*”.

Regarding the internal communication, it was agreed that the main channel of communication among Lead Authors, Contributing Authors, Scientific Chair and GFEP coordination team will be via e-mail and, if needed, via Skype. IUFRO will provide an option to host internal files and share documents related to the assessment on the IUFRO GFEP RR website, with access restricted to the scientists and GFEP coordination/editing team.

Agreed tentative timeline of the assessment is as follows:

Scoping Meeting of GFEP RR (Nairobi, Kenya)	18-19 May 2016
Chapter/section outlines finalized	End of June 2016
Final draft of chapter/section manuscripts	End of August 2016
Scientific expert meeting (Vienna, Austria): <i>Presentations by Lead Authors and review of chapters</i>	20-21 September 2016
CITES COP 17 (Johannesburg, SA): <i>Presentation of emerging key findings</i>	24 Sept – 5 Oct 2016
Final drafts of sections and chapters	5 October 2016
Editing/layout of the Assessment Report and Policy Brief	October-November 2016
Printing of the Assessment Report and Policy Brief	End of Nov 2016
CBD COP13 (Cancun, Mexico): <i>Launch of the report and presentation of results</i>	4 – 17 Dec 2016

In bold: Crucial meetings/deadlines for all Lead Authors

It was agreed that by the end of June 2016, all Lead Authors would send in the detailed outlines of their chapters. Lead Authors were urged to also think of countries for which they could provide case studies/examples. It was also agreed that all authors would already think how to visualize the key messages of their chapters.

The next meeting where all Lead Authors will meet is the Scientific Expert Meeting, scheduled to take place in Vienna, Austria from 20 to 21 September, 2016. The meeting is by invitation only and in addition to Lead Authors and Contributing Authors, other scientists, expert institutions and invited stakeholders will be attending. The Scientific Meeting takes place just before the EFI Annual Conference in Vienna, Austria (22-24 September), enabling the participation in both events, if so wished. In case a Lead Author is not able to participate in the Scientific Meeting, he/she needs to send a substitute on his/her behalf to the meeting (e.g. Contributing Author in their chapter).

Since the timeline for the GFEP Rapid Response assessment is fairly tight, there is not enough time for a full peer-review of the assessment, once the chapters are sent in. Scientists were strongly in favour of carrying out some kind of a review. The GFEP Coordination team will be looking into different options to accommodate this wish. The time between the deadline for sending in their draft chapter manuscripts (end of August 2016) and the date of the Scientific Meeting (20-21 September) could be used for review purposes. It was also mentioned that the Scientific Expert Meeting, scheduled to take place in September 20-21 in Vienna, would serve the purpose of a review.

In summarizing the outcomes of the Scoping Meeting, moderator Ms Daniela Kleinschmit outlined the next steps:

- The GFEP Project Manager finalizes the minutes of the meeting and sends it together with the list of participants to all meeting participants. He will also send Editorial Guidelines, the List of Publications and the List of Potential Contributing Authors to Lead Authors.
- Lead Authors for chapters 5, 6 and 7 will continue to work on the outlines of their chapters and will send it to GFEP coordination team.
- The next most important deadline for all Lead Authors is the end of June 2016, when they should send in the detailed outlines of their chapters, including a list of possible country examples, which could be used in their chapters.
- Before the Scientific Meeting in Vienna, Austria from 20 to 21 September, all Lead Authors have to send in their draft chapter manuscripts by the end of August 2016.

9) Closing Remarks

In closing the meeting, Ms Daniela Kleinschmit as the moderator and Scientific Chair of the assessment reiterated thanks to UNEP for hosting the session, and to all participants for their excellent input and contributions.

ANNEX: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Scientists and Lead Authors:

Mr Luca Tacconi

Professor of Environmental Governance
Director of Asia Pacific Network for Environmental Governance
Crawford School of Public Policy
The Australian National University
JG Crawford Building, 132 Lennox Crossing
Acton ACT 0200, Australia
E-mail: luca.tacconi@anu.edu.au

Mr Paolo Omar Cerutti

Senior Scientist
Forests and Governance Programme
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)
C/O World Agroforestry Centre
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri
P.O. Box 30677 – 00100, Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: p.cerutti@cgiar.org

Mr Benjamin Cashore

Professor of Environmental Governance and Political Science
Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies
195 Prospect Street
New Haven, CT 06511, USA
E-mail: benjamin.cashore@yale.edu

Mr Pablo Pacheco

Principal Scientist
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)
Jalan CIFOR
Situ Gede, Bogor
16115, Indonesia
E-mail: p.pacheco@cgiar.org

Mr Tim Boekhout van Solinge

Criminological researcher
Utrecht University School of Law
Janskerkhof 12, 3512 BL
Utrecht, the Netherlands
E-mail: t.boekhoutvansolinge@uu.nl

Mr Jianbang Gan

Professor in Forest Economics and Management
Department of Ecosystem Science and Management
Texas A&M University
2138 TAMU
College Station, Texas 77843-2138 USA
E-mail: j-gan@tamu.edu

Ms Sina Leipold

Research associate
Forest and Environmental Policy Group at
Chair of Forest and Environmental Policy
University of Freiburg
Tennenbacher Str. 4 (4 OG)
D- 79106 Freiburg, Germany
E-mail: Sina.Leipold@ifp.uni-freiburg.de

Mr Benno Pokorny

Academic senior councillor at
Chair of Silviculture
University of Freiburg
Tennenbacherstrasse 4
D-79106 Freiburg i.Br. Germany
E-mail: benno.pokorny@waldbau.uni-freiburg.de

Ms Daniela Kleinschmit

Professor and Chair of Forest and Environmental Policy
Coordinator of IUFRO Division 9
University of Freiburg
Tennenbacher Str. 4 (4 OG)
D- 79106 Freiburg, Germany
E-mail: daniela.kleinschmit@ifp.uni-freiburg.de

GFEP donor agencies:

Mr Patrick Sieber

Program Officer
Global Programme on Climate Change
Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)
Freiburgstrasse 130, 3003
Bern, Switzerland
E-mail: Patrick.Sieber@eda.admin.ch

CPF members:

Mr Giovanni Ruta

Environment and Natural Resources Global Practice
The World Bank
1818 H Street, NW
Washington, DC 20433, USA
E-mail: gruta@worldbank.org

Ms Elsie Gyekyawaa Attafuah

Senior Regional Technical Advisor to the
UNDP/UN-REDD Regional Programme for Africa
United Nations Office at Nairobi
Nairobi, Kenya 00200
E-mail: elsie.atafuah@undp.org

Ms Barbara Tavora-Jainchill

Forest Affairs Officer
United Nations Forum on Forests (UNFF) Secretariat
Department of Economic and Social Affairs
Two United Nations Plaza, DC2-2301
New York, NY 10017, USA
E-mail: tavora-jainchill@un.org

Ms Daphne Hewitt

Forestry Officer
EU FAO FLEGT Programme
FAO Sub-regional office for Mesoamerica
Panama city, Panama
E-mail: Daphne.Hewitt@fao.org

Expert institutions and partners:

Mr Valentin Vasilyevich Emelin

Programme Leader Environment and Crime Programme
Senior Advisor to the Managing Director
GRID-Arendal
N-4802 Arendal, Norway
E-mail: valentin.yemelin@grida.no

Mr Tim Dawson

FLEGT VPA Expert
EU FLEGT Facility
European Forest Institute
Barcelona, Spain
E-mail: tim.dawson@efi.int

Mr Psamson Nzioki

Deputy Programme Officer
Climate Governance Integrity Programme
Transparency International – Kenya
1st Ngong Avenue off Bishops Road, Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: pnyioki@tikenya.org

Mr Leonard Mindore

OHCHR Indigenous Fellow
Director, Program For The Heritage Of Ogiek and Mother Earth (PRO-HOME)
Nakuru, Kenya
E-mail: mindore@ogiekheritage.org, lmindore@yahoo.com

Mr Julius Titi

Regional Specialized Officer
Global Outreach and Regional Support (GORS)
INTERPOL Regional Bureau in Nairobi
Nairobi – Kenya
E-mail: J.Titi@interpol.int

UNEP representatives:

Mr Tim Christophersen

Senior Programme Officer, Forests and Climate Change
United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri
PO Box 30552, 00100, Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: Tim.Christophersen@unep.org

Ms Bianca Notabartolo

Illegal Trade in Wildlife
Division of Environmental Policy Implementation
United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri
Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: Bianca.Notabartolo@unep.org

Mr Arnold Kreilhuber

Legal Officer in the Division of Environmental Law and Conventions
United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri
PO Box 30552, 00100, Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: Arnold.Kreilhuber@unep.org

Ms Jaime Alexandra Webbe

Programme Management Officer
United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)
United Nations Avenue, Gigiri
PO Box 30552, 00100
Nairobi, Kenya
E-mail: Jaime.Webbe@unep.org

IUFRO and GFEP coordination:

Mr Alexander Buck

Executive Director
International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)
Marxergasse 2
1030 Vienna, Austria
E-mail: buck@iufro.org

Mr Andre Purret

GFEP Project Manager
International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)
Marxergasse 2
1030 Vienna, Austria
E-mail: purret@iufro.org

Regrettably had to cancel their participation:

Mr Christoph Wildburger

GFEP Coordinator, Consultant
Environmental Policy and
Natural Resource Management
Lilienbrunnngasse 18/2/52, 1020 Vienna, Austria
E-mail: office@wildburger.cc

Ms Laura Wellesley

Research Associate
Energy, Environment and Resources Department
Chatham House
10 St James's Square, London
SW1Y 4LE, United Kingdom
E-mail: LWellesley@chathamhouse.org

Ms Catalina Santamaria

Forest Programme Officer
Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)
413 St. Jacques Street, Office 800
Montréal, Québec, Canada, H2Y 1N9
E-mail: catalina.santamaria@cbd.int

Ms Cynthia Mackie

Asia-Pacific Program Coordinator
U.S. Forest Service International Programs
1 Thomas Circle, NW, Suite 400
Washington D.C., United States
E-mail: cmackie@fs.fed.us

Mr Marcellin Nziengui

Représentant Régional de l'OIBT pour l'Afrique /
ITTO Regional Officer For Africa
Chef Projet PD700 / ITTO PD700 Project Manager
B.P. 329 Libreville (Gabon)
E-mail: nzienqui@itto.int

Mr Javier Montano

The Regional Coordinator Wildlife and
Forest Crime Programme –Eastern Africa
United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC)
E-mail: Javier.Montano@unodc.org