



## CPF GLOBAL FOREST EXPERT PANELS

### 1<sup>ST</sup> MEETING OF THE EXPERT PANEL ON FORESTS AND POVERTY

(ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN, USA, 27-29 AUGUST 2019)

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING

*23 September 2019*

The Global Forest Expert Panel (GFEP) on Forests and Poverty convened for its first meeting on 27-29 August 2019 at the campus of the University of Michigan in Ann Arbor, USA. The meeting was kindly hosted by the Forests & Livelihoods: Assessment, Research, and Engagement (FLARE) network and the University of Michigan. Twenty participants, including seventeen Panel Members and the GFEP team attended the meeting. It was moderated by GFEP Coordinator Christoph Wildburger and the Scientific Chair of the assessment, Daniel C. Miller. A full list of participants is annexed to the minutes.

### 1) Opening of the Meeting

*Document: Draft Agenda - 1st Panel Meeting of GFEP on Forests and Poverty*

Christoph Wildburger, GFEP Coordinator, opened the meeting and welcomed the participants on behalf of the GFEP initiative and the International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO). He then gave the floor to Arun Agrawal, FLARE Coordinator and Samuel Trask Dana Professor of the University of Michigan for his welcoming remarks on behalf of the host of the meeting. He stressed the relevance of the topic and wished participants a successful meeting and stay in Ann Arbor.

In his introductory remarks Christoph Wildburger briefly explained the background of the meeting and introduced the GFEP team. Mr Wildburger then set out the draft agenda of the meeting as well as the organization of work during the meeting.

### 2) Brief Introduction of Participants

Participants introduced themselves in a *tour de table*. Andre Purret, GFEP project manager, conveyed regrets from Panel Members who could not attend the meeting. It was noted that a couple of them will try to connect to parts of the meeting virtually. The list of participants, annexed to the minutes, also includes the names and contacts of non-participating Panel Members. Participants in the meeting were asked to sign a consent form regarding the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR), allowing IUFRO to store and process personal contact details, incl. photos, for the purpose of the GFEP assessment on Forests and Poverty.

### 3) Introduction to the Assessment

Documents: Terms of Reference - GFEP on Forests and Poverty; GFEP Rules of Procedure

Mr Wildburger explained that the Global Forest Expert Panels (GFEP) initiative was launched by the CPF in April 2007 as a mechanism to support forest-related intergovernmental processes by producing assessment reports on emerging global issues of high concern. GFEP provides its reports to international forums (e.g. UNFF, CBD, UNFCCC, UN-SDGs) to support informed decision-making at the global level. The initiative is led and coordinated in the CPF by IUFRO.

Thematic assessment reports produced by GFEP consolidate available existing scientific information and expertise. They are prepared by panels of internationally recognized scientific experts and undergo rigorous peer review. All scientific experts participate in the assessment in their personal capacity and do not represent any organization or institution. Authors assess and synthesize existing scientific literature and information. Outcomes of the assessments serve as briefing documents for negotiators, guidance for strategic policy development, information for communicators and as teaching materials.

Mr Wildburger noted that the main goal of this Panel is to carry out a comprehensive assessment of scientific knowledge regarding the relationship between forests and poverty and to produce a comprehensive peer-reviewed scientific report and associated policy brief on the topic in the second half of 2020. The assessment aims to contribute to the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and provide input to the 2020 session of the High-Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development (HLPF 2020) and the 75th session of the UN General Assembly (UNGA 75). In addition, the outcomes will be of particular relevance also for the 15th and 16th sessions of the United Nations Forum on Forests (in May 2020 and 2021), FAO COFO-25 (summer 2020) and possibly for other forest-related forums, such as CBD COP-15 and UNFCCC COP-26 in autumn 2020.

Mr Wildburger then explained the main key points and items contained in the “GFEP Rules of Procedure” and the “Terms of Reference of the Expert Panel on Forests and Poverty”. He briefed the participants on the task of the Expert Panel; main thematic elements to be covered in the assessment report; composition and the modalities of work of the Expert Panel; sources of information to be used; the peer review process; main outcomes of the assessment; and the duration of work and key deadlines in the timeline of the assessment. He informed participants that the format of the assessment report will follow those of previous GFEP reports. Detailed instructions and guidance are included in the “Editorial guidelines” and will be sent to the authors after the meeting in Ann Arbor. Panel Members are expected to follow these editorial guidelines throughout the assessment process.

Mr Wildburger emphasized the need to use agreed terminology and pointed out that the report will include a glossary. He then introduced the roles, tasks and responsibilities of Panel Members. He highlighted that Coordinating Lead Authors (CLAs) are responsible for delivering integrated chapter manuscripts, Lead Authors (LAs) produce designated chapter sections, and Contributing Authors (CAs) assist with preparing chapter sections and elements.

He then outlined the following objectives of the 1<sup>st</sup> Panel meeting: to introduce Panel Members to the context, goals and specific objectives of the assessment and its deliverables;

to agree on key concepts and methodological approaches; to develop a comprehensive, annotated outline of the assessment report and its chapters; to clarify the roles, expectations, and specific contributions of Panel Members as authors of the assessment report; to identify specific areas of expertise that require involvement of additional Lead Authors and/or Contributing Authors (CA); and to refine the schedule for completion of the assessment report.

Participants then discussed the distribution of the outcomes and main audiences, as well as the possible impacts of the assessment report.

#### **4) General Discussion on Key Concepts and Annotated Outline of the Assessment**

Mr Wildburger explained the draft thematic outline of the assessment (Annex I of the Terms of Reference) and invited comments from the participants. Participants discussed the framing and context of the report and its chapters, approaches for addressing the guiding questions for each chapter, availability of data and metrics, use of terminology and definitions (e.g. “poverty”, “wellbeing”, “livelihoods”), need to identify relevant dimensions and dynamics related to poverty, time frames and scales to be used in the assessment, spatial scope of the study, interdisciplinarity of chapters, information sources, the use of knowledge, and research gaps. The group went one by one through the thematic elements listed in the Terms of Reference and agreed on the order and content of possible chapters. All elements listed in the Terms of Reference will be covered in the new structure and chapter arrangement.

#### **5) Allocation of Panel Members to Chapters**

The moderator invited the Panel Members to announce their preferred allocation to the chapters of the assessment and encouraged them to contribute to more than one chapter. All participants expressed their interest in chapters in a *tour de table*. Mr Purrett informed the group about the preferences of those Panel Members that were not able to participate in the meeting in person.

Following the moderator’s proposal, Panel Members anonymously agreed to designate Prof. Daniel C. Miller (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA) as the Scientific Chair of the Expert Panel on Forests and Poverty. Panel Members then announced their roles as CLA or LA in drafting specific chapters to the Chair.

#### **6) Break-out Groups**

The Panel split into break-out groups to further elaborate the structure of the assessment and to refine chapter outlines.

#### **7) Reporting Back from Break-out Groups**

The Chair of the assessment asked break-out groups to report the outcomes of their work to the plenary.

## **8) Discussion of Issues Arising**

The Panel discussed the reports from break-out groups and emerging issues, including the conceptual approaches, overlaps between chapters and methodological issues.

## **9) Break-out Groups**

Chapter teams further developed the detailed chapter outlines and discussed the work schedule of chapters. They divided their tasks according to the refined outlines.

## **10) Break-out Groups**

Chapter teams discussed the designation of tasks to Lead Authors within the chapters, agreed on the work schedule of chapters.

## **11) Reporting back from Chapter Groups by Coordinating Lead Authors**

The Chair of the Expert Panel asked groups to report to the plenary on progress made so far back. Designated Coordinating Lead Authors (CLAs) reported on the progress made. The Panel discussed also the involvement of additional experts.

The revised outline of the assessment report is structured into the following chapters:

- 1) Introduction
- 2) Framing chapter
- 3) Forest-poverty dynamics: current state of knowledge
- 4) Proximate causes and underlying conditions
- 5) Levers of change
- 6) Response options including prospects
- 7) Conclusions

## **12) Discussion of issues arising**

It was agreed that chapters 2 to 6 shall include conclusions and knowledge gaps, case studies and examples, and shall address the cross-cutting issues including indigenous knowledge, gender perspectives as well as accountability and metrics. It was also decided that the page limit for chapters 3, 4 and 5 will be extended as these would be the chapters requiring slightly more space than others. In addition, it was decided that as Chapter 6 on “Response options” is largely based on the previous chapters, this chapter will be developed later on and has separate deadlines for drafting the manuscript.

As an additional request, Chapter 3 invited Panel Members to send relevant resources/literature on large-scale studies and analyses that could be beneficial to the drafting of Chapter 3 on “Forest-poverty dynamics: current state of knowledge”.

All Coordinating Lead Authors of chapters were asked to engage also those Panel Members who were not able to join the meeting in Ann Arbor in their chapter work as soon as possible.

### **13) Organization of work**

Mr Wildburger showed the tentative timeline of the assessment and provided information about key milestones. The Panel agreed that the next important deadline is 30 September 2019, when the final detailed chapter outlines are due. It was emphasized that these detailed outlines have to also include the responsibilities of authors in drafting sections of chapters. The deadline for turning in first drafts of chapter manuscripts was set to 20 December 2019.

The GFEP team informed the meeting participants about the proposed dates of the other Panel Meeting. Based on the discussions in the room, it was decided that the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Expert Panel on Forests and Poverty will be held from 29-31 January 2020, either in Nairobi, Kenya or Vienna, Austria. The dates for the third and last meeting of the Expert Panel were set to 15-17 April 2020, location to be confirmed.

Mr Purret informed the participants about the technical support to the Panel, such as the GFEP website, Google Drive for documents and the e-mail forwarders. The list of Panel Members, minutes of the Panel Meetings and other relevant information for the public will be uploaded to <https://www.iufro.org/science/gfep/forests-and-poverty-panel/>. Participants discussed also the communication between authors, within chapters and between all Panel Members.

The revised tentative timetable of the assessment was set as follows:

Scoping Meeting - GFEP Forests and Poverty (Rome, Italy)	23 – 24 May 2019
Terms of Reference for the Expert Panel	June 2019
Selecting members of the GFEP Expert Panel	June/July 2019
1 <sup>st</sup> meeting of the Expert Panel (Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA)	27 – 29 August 2019
Detailed chapter outlines	30 September 2019
First draft manuscripts of chapters	20 December 2019
2 <sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Expert Panel (Nairobi/Vienna)	29 – 31 January 2020
Final draft of chapters for peer review	February 2020
Peer review process of chapters	February/March 2020
3 <sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Expert Panel (location tbc)	15 – 17 April 2020
Final revision of the chapters	End of April 2020
Editing of the Assessment Report	May - June 2020
Development and editing of Policy Brief	May - June 2020
Layout of the Assessment Report and Policy Brief	July 2020
Printing the Assessment Report and Policy Brief	August 2020
Launch – 75 <sup>th</sup> session of the UN General Assembly (UNGA 75), New York City, USA.	15 – 30 September 2020

#### 14) Closing Remarks and Closure of the Meeting

Daniel C. Miller as the Chair of the assessment thanked participants for their efforts and hard work. He asked Panel Members to work on their chapter outlines within the chapter groups until the first deadline (30 September). Panel Members were also requested to confirm their allocation in chapter teams. The Chair looked forward to working with Panel Members and wished everyone a safe journey home.

On behalf of IUFRO and the GFEP team, Christoph Wildburger thanked the participants for their strong commitment, looked forward to seeing everyone in the 2<sup>nd</sup> Expert Panel Meeting, and closed the meeting.

## **ANNEX I: List of Participants**

### **Mr Arun Agrawal**

Samuel Trask Dana Professor  
School for Environment and Sustainability (SEAS)  
Forests & Livelihoods: Assessment, Research, and Engagement (FLARE)  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor, Michigan, United States  
E-mail: [arunagra@umich.edu](mailto:arunagra@umich.edu)

### **Ms Monica Gabay**

Coordinator  
IUFRO Working Party 9.05.06 “Community forestry”  
Research Group on Environment and Policy  
National University of San Martin  
Buenos Aires, Argentina  
E-mail: [monagabay@yahoo.com](mailto:monagabay@yahoo.com)

### **Ms Reem Hajjar**

Assistant Professor  
Department of Forest Ecosystems & Society  
College of Forestry  
Oregon State University  
Corvallis, Oregon, United States  
E-mail: [reem.hajjar@oregonstate.edu](mailto:reem.hajjar@oregonstate.edu)

### **Mr Markus Ihalainen**

Senior Research Officer, Gender Co-Coordinator  
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR-ICRAF)  
Nairobi, Kenya/Sweden  
E-mail: [m.ihalainen@cgiar.org](mailto:m.ihalainen@cgiar.org)

### **Ms Pamela A. Jagger**

Associate Professor  
School for Environment and Sustainability (SEAS)  
University of Michigan  
Michigan, United States  
E-mail: [pjagger@umich.edu](mailto:pjagger@umich.edu)

### **Ms Gillian Kabwe**

Senior Lecturer  
Department of Plant and Environmental Sciences  
School of Natural Resources  
The Copperbelt University  
Kitwe, Zambia  
E-mail: [gillian.kabwe@cbu.ac.zm](mailto:gillian.kabwe@cbu.ac.zm)

**Ms Judith Kamoto**

Acting Deputy College Director  
Senior lecturer of Forestry and Rural Development, Faculty of Natural Resources  
Lilongwe University of Agriculture and Natural Resources (LUANAR)  
Lilongwe, Malawi  
E-mail: [jkamoto@luanar.ac.mw](mailto:jkamoto@luanar.ac.mw)

**Ms Doris Mutta**

Senior Programme Officer  
The African Forest Forum (AFF)  
Nairobi, Kenya  
E-mail: [D.Mutta@cgiar.org](mailto:D.Mutta@cgiar.org)

**Mr Daniel C. Miller**

Assistant Professor  
Department of Natural Resources and Environmental Sciences (NRES)  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
Urbana, Illinois, United States  
E-mail: [dcmiller@illinois.edu](mailto:dcmiller@illinois.edu)

**Mr Peter Newton**

Assistant Professor  
Environmental Studies Program, University of Colorado Boulder  
Sustainability, Energy, and Environment Community (SEEC)  
Boulder, Colorado, United States  
E-mail: [peter.newton@colorado.edu](mailto:peter.newton@colorado.edu)

**Mr Johan Oldekop**

Senior Lecturer in Environment & Development  
Global Development Institute  
School of Environment, Education and Development, University of Manchester  
Manchester, United Kingdom  
E-mail: [Johan.Oldekop@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:Johan.Oldekop@manchester.ac.uk)

**Mr Nitin D. Rai**

Fellow  
Ashoka Trust for Research in Ecology and the Environment (ATREE)  
Bangalore, India  
E-mail: [nitinrai@atree.org](mailto:nitinrai@atree.org)

**Ms Laura Vang Rasmussen**

Assistant professor  
Section for Geography  
Department of Geosciences and Natural Resource Management  
University of Copenhagen  
Copenhagen, Denmark  
E-mail: [lr@ign.ku.dk](mailto:lr@ign.ku.dk)



**Ms Onja H. Razafindratsima**

Assistant Professor  
Department of Natural Resource Management  
South Dakota State University  
Brookings, South Dakota, United States  
E-mail: [onja.razafindratsima@sdstate.edu](mailto:onja.razafindratsima@sdstate.edu)

**Ms Priya Shyamsundar**

Lead Economist  
The Nature Conservancy  
South Asian Network for Development and Environmental Economics (SANDEE)  
Arlington, Virginia, United States  
E-mail: [Priya.shyamsundar@tnc.org](mailto:Priya.shyamsundar@tnc.org)

**Ms Erin Sills**

Professor, Department of Forestry and Environmental Resources  
College of Natural Resources  
North Carolina State University (NCSU)  
Raleigh, North Carolina, United States  
E-mail: [sills@ncsu.edu](mailto:sills@ncsu.edu)

**Ms Joleen Timko**

Principal, Sylvae Research & Consulting  
University of British Columbia (UBC)  
Vancouver, Canada  
E-mail: [joleen.timko@me.com](mailto:joleen.timko@me.com)

**Members of the GFEP team:**

**Mr Andre Purret**

GFEP Project Manager  
International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)  
Marxergasse 2, 1030 Vienna, Austria  
E-mail: [purret@iufro.org](mailto:purret@iufro.org)

**Ms Eva-Maria Schimpf**

GFEP administration and project management  
International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)  
Marxergasse 2, 1030 Vienna, Austria  
E-mail: [schimpf@iufro.org](mailto:schimpf@iufro.org)

**Mr Christoph Wildburger**

GFEP Coordinator  
International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO)  
Marxergasse 2, 1030 Vienna, Austria  
E-mail: [wildburger@iufro.org](mailto:wildburger@iufro.org)

**Regrettably could not participate in the meeting:**

**Mr Arild Angelsen**

Professor, School of Economics and Business  
Department of Economics and Resource Management  
Norwegian School of Life Sciences (NMBU)  
Senior Associate, Centre for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)  
Ås, Norway  
E-mail: [arild.angelsen@nmbu.no](mailto:arild.angelsen@nmbu.no)

**Mr Edward B. Barbier**

University Distinguished Professor, Department of Economics  
Senior Scholar, School of Global Environmental Sustainability  
Colorado State University  
Department of Economics  
Clark, Fort Collins, CO, USA  
E-mail: [Edward.Barbier@colostate.edu](mailto:Edward.Barbier@colostate.edu)

**Ms Stephanie Mansourian**

GFEP editor  
Consultant – Environment and Development  
36 Mont d'Eau du Milieu  
1276 Gingins, Switzerland  
E-mail: [smansourian@infomaniak.ch](mailto:smansourian@infomaniak.ch)

**Mr Casey M. Ryan**

Senior Lecturer in Ecosystem Services and Global Change  
School of GeoSciences  
University of Edinburgh  
Edinburgh, United Kingdom  
E-mail: [casey.ryan@ed.ac.uk](mailto:casey.ryan@ed.ac.uk)

**Mr Terry Sunderland**

Professor, Faculty of Forestry  
University of British Columbia  
Senior Associate  
Centre for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)  
Vancouver, Canada  
E-mail: [terry.sunderland@ubc.ca](mailto:terry.sunderland@ubc.ca)